

Pre-Employment Integrity Testing Using the Critical Hire-Screen and Step One Survey II

Tony Tatman
Critical Hire

Executive Summary

Study Introduction and Purpose:

This study compared the Critical Hire-Screen (CH-S) and the Profile International's Step One Survey II (SOS II). This comparison examined the degree to which both tools could predict supervisor ratings of job performance and comply with EEOC and other Federal hiring guidelines. The CH-S is the integrity scale portion of the larger Critical Hire-Profile and was developed specifically with and for law enforcement and community-based corrections (CBC) applicants. The CH-S measures an applicant's honesty and core beliefs in five unique areas: Substances (i.e., beliefs supporting the use or selling of drugs in the workplace, and/or use of alcohol in the workplace), Theft (i.e., beliefs supporting theft in the workplace), Authority (i.e., negative beliefs toward supervisors or authority), Rules & Deception (i.e., beliefs supporting rule-breaking, manipulating others, and deceptive behaviors), and Responsibility (i.e., beliefs supporting blaming victims for crimes). The SOS II was developed on a general population in the workforce and has been used internationally as a general tool of integrity. The SOS II measures attitudes held in 4 primary domains of work conduct: Integrity (i.e., theft of money, time and property), Substance Abuse (i.e., personal use or distribution of illegal substances), Reliability (i.e., the degree to which they will follow rules or procedures), and Work Ethic (i.e., attitudes toward work and supervisors). Analyses were completed on 83 employees working in multiple Midwest CBC agencies.

Results:

1. Statistics measuring the relationship between the CH-S and SOS II and job performance ratings revealed:
 - a. All 5 scales of the CH-S showed relationships with job performance ratings.
 - b. None of the SOS II scales showed a relationship with job performance ratings.
2. Statistics measuring the degree to which the CH-S and SOS II could differentiate average or top performers from below average or poor performers revealed:
 - a. The CH-S was able to significantly and accurately differentiate between employees who were rated as either average or top performers from below average or poor performers.
 - b. The SOS II was not able to significantly or accurately differentiate average or top performers from below average or poor performers.

3. Discrimination analyses were also conducted to measure the degree to which the CH-S and SOS II scale scores differed based on age, gender and racial/ethnic status.
 - a. CH-S results
 - i. Age – No significant differences between people 40 or older versus 39 or younger
 - ii. Gender – No significant differences between males and females.
 - iii. Racial/ethnic status - No significant differences were found between Caucasian and minority (i.e., African American, Hispanic, Asian, and Bosnian) applicants.
 - b. SOS II results
 - i. Age - No significant differences between people 40 or older versus 39 or younger.
 - ii. Gender – The Integrity scale on the SOS II was significantly higher (a more favorable score) for females than males. All other SOS II scales showed no significant differences.
 - iii. Racial/ethnic status - No significant differences were found between Caucasian and minority (i.e., African American, Hispanic, Asian, and Bosnian) applicants.

Implications for Hiring Agencies:

There are a lot of pre-employment, integrity tests on the market so it's important for hiring agencies to know what works, particularly in the high-risk occupations of law enforcement and corrections. This study provides evidence that both the CH-S and SOS II do not contribute to discrimination based on age, gender, or racial/ethnic status. This finding is valuable for CBCs by providing added support that both the CH-S and SOS II do not contribute to discrimination and therefore are in compliance with EEOC and other Federal hiring guidelines. When it comes to predictive accuracy, however, **only the CH-S was able to predict future workplace performance**. This is valuable for CBCs by providing additional evidence that the CH-S can effectively and accurately identify applicants who will end up being either acceptable / top performers versus applicants likely to be below average / poor performers.

Pre-Employment Integrity Testing Using the Critical Hire-Screen and Step One Survey II was published in *Corrections: Policy, Practice and Research* on April 17, 2022.